The Role of Data Journalists as Educators

MANDI CAI, Northwestern University, United States

MATTHEW KAY, Northwestern University, United States

In 2020, data journalists reported on complex, dynamic issues like COVID-19 and the U.S. presidential election, publishing articles that used data to visualize a narrative and articles that explicitly instructed audiences on how to interpret data and data visualizations. Data journalism may very well be instrumental in developing the public's familiarity with and literacy in data and data visualizations, but it remains unclear how to define or measure literacy cultivated by data and visual journalism. It also remains unclear how best to support data journalists in teaching their readers. Moreover, data journalists frequently report on polarizing topics involving data that is subject to widespread disagreement. This raises the question of how to teach data and data visualization literacy while considering opposing values and ideologies among audiences. I outline existing definitions of data and data visualization literacy, and propose some future directions for how data journalists could support this literacy among their readers and partner with educators.

Additional Key Words and Phrases: data literacy, visualization literacy, data journalism

ACM Reference Format:

1 INTRODUCTION

The year 2020 was a monumental year for data journalists. As the COVID-19 virus swept the world, data journalists, alongside researchers and public health officials, immediately spun up dashboards showing COVID-19 data and used this data to publish critical stories about the pandemic's impact [1, 26, 27]. These dashboards were accompanied by many explanatory articles on how to interpret COVID-19 data and predictions. For example, The Star Tribune published an article explaining why models of COVID-19's impact on Minnesota varied drastically in the number of projected deaths [8]. The New York Times published articles that explained how to interpret a logarithmic line chart and what it meant to "flatten the curve" [7, 25]. In addition to a pandemic that forced the entire world to understand COVID-19 models and data visualizations, a U.S. presidential election took place in 2020. Noteworthy examples of how data journalists attempted to cultivate data and visualization literacy in the elections domain included articles explaining how political campaigns use data on voters to inform their campaign tactics [11] and how to read election maps [21, 22]. Throughout 2020, data journalists and the broader news media were repeatedly thrust into the role of helping diverse audiences make sense of data and data visualizations amid mixed messaging and misinterpretations. However, in a fast-paced

- ⁴⁹ © 2024 Association for Computing Machinery.
- ⁵⁰ Manuscript submitted to ACM

Permission to make digital or hard copies of all or part of this work for personal or classroom use is granted without fee provided that copies are not made or distributed for profit or commercial advantage and that copies bear this notice and the full citation on the first page. Copyrights for components of this work owned by others than ACM must be honored. Abstracting with credit is permitted. To copy otherwise, or republish, to post on servers or to redistribute to lists, requires prior specific permission and/or a fee. Request permissions from permissions@acm.org.

Cai

newsroom, it is not always clear what the educational value of data and visual journalism is or how to measure it. In a 53 54 study by Fink and Anderson [10], the data journalists interviewed said they "knew little about how their audiences 55 interacted with their stories." 56

- I propose exploring the vital role that data journalists play as educators of data and data visualization literacy, and how to teach and measure this literacy in a polarized media landscape when the data itself is controversial. Content encountered in the news media, whether it be through online news websites, broadcast and cable television, or social media platforms, serve as opportunities for audiences to engage and reason with data and visualizations on topics that impact their daily life and community. However, this relevance to people's lived experiences also means that the meaning of the data may be subject to disagreement and even politicization, like numbers of COVID-19 cases or vote tallies during elections. Indeed, several studies [15, 18, 23] have called for visualization researchers to factor in 65 the values that individuals hold and the contexts individuals are embedded in when they engage with data and data 67 visualizations. Making matters more complicated, data and data visualizations in the news are often evolving stories that change as more information is known.
- 68 69 70 71

72

75

77

78

81

82

83

57

58

59 60

61

62

63

64

66

2 EXISTING FRAMEWORKS FOR DATA AND VISUALIZATION LITERACY

To define *data literacy*, Calzada Prado and Marzal [6] propose a framework for librarians that segments data literacy 73 into understanding data, finding and obtaining data, reading, interpreting and evaluating data, managing data, and 74 using data. Across data literacy frameworks, there are explicit mentions of data literacy as the ability to use 76 data in the process of evidence-based thinking to solve real-world problems, as well as an emphasis on the importance of the data's context [28, 29]. For example, Wolff et al. [29] envision data literacy as a pool of skills and knowledge that includes specialized skills unique to the specific context that the individual is using the data in. 79 80 Gummer and Mandinach [14] describe a conceptual framework of what data literacy looks like for teachers who can use data to inform their teaching practices and track the progress of students. Given the mass amounts of recorded data across a variety of contexts, Bhargava [3] argues for conceptualizing data literacy as "literacy in the age of data", or "the desire and ability to constructively engage in society through or about data" [3].

84 85

> In the realm of visualization literacy, Boy et al. [4], Börner et al. [5], and Lee et al. [19] have provided definitions of 86 87 visualization literacy that all specify one's ability to read, understand, and make meaning from the visual representations 88 of data, with Ge et al. [12] extending past definitions to include a critical thinking component - "the ability to read, 89 interpret, and reason about erroneous or potentially misleading visualizations." Börner et al. [5] note a gap in best 90 practices for teaching visualization design and present a process model for data visualization construction with the 91 92 goal of creating a visualization for some purpose. Visualization and data literacy inevitably overlap as it is necessary to 93 understand the data being visualized.

94 95

Several of the aforementioned frameworks mention the importance of considering socio-cultural contexts. Both Wolff 96 et al. [29] and Gummer and Mandinach [14] echo this sentiment, stating that teaching data should be "responsive to 97 cultural differences that might affect individual learner's view of the world" [29] and "expand beyond a cognitive focus 98 99 on knowledge and skills to include beliefs/values, identity, and epistemic elements" [14]. Indeed, one's identity can 100 impact how they make sense of data and data visualizations. Ericson et al. showed how political partisanship moderates 101 participants' subjective interpretations of COVID-19 data and data visualizations [9]. Another study by Kahan et al. 102 [16] showed that participants with higher numeracy - one's ability to interpret and use numbers, often probabilities, 103

to draw valid inferences [20, 24] – exhibited more polarized interpretations of data on a ban on carrying concealed weapons in public and its relationship to crime numbers, compared with data on skin rashes and its relationship to skin cream use. Individuals with higher numeracy used their increased cognitive ability to bend their interpretation of the concealed carry data to conform with their own political leanings.

3 PATHS FORWARD

105 106

107

108

109 110

111 112

113

117

120

137

How do these frameworks translate to the learning experiences of viewing data and data visualizations in the news? How might we adapt them for data journalists who are interested in fostering data and data 114 115 visualization literacy? To support data journalists, it is crucial to define what successful learning looks like when 116 a reader engages with their data and visual journalism. This metric will likely depend on what purpose specific audiences have in mind when reading these articles, and data journalists' perceptions of their own roles as 118 educators and how they service the public. 119

For example, if a reader comes to a news article with forecast visualizations of COVID-19 case trends for the next two 121 weeks, what skills would this reader need to have in order to make an appropriate decision from these visualizations 122 123 that aligns with that reader's risk tolerance? Some of the required skills and knowledge would translate across the 124 reader's experiences with similar types of visualizations, but some are also specific to that specific topic, decision, and 125 the reader's current priorities. Future research can intentionally dissect understanding and usage of data and data 126 127 visualizations within contentious topics in news media across participants of varying values, ideology, and political 128 affiliations, taking note of the external evidence that individuals bring in to support their reasoning. The public does not 129 interpret data and data visualizations in a vacuum. They may engage with it in a news article, draw some inferences, 130 and continue evolving their understanding of the data visualization as it relates to some larger narrative. It is thus worth 131 asking, in the context of our media landscape, whether teaching data and data visualization literacy should include 132 133 fostering one's ability to discuss a visualization and acknowledge the uncertainty inherent in any quantified 134 representation of dynamic, complex issues. It is not a cleanly scoped, one-to-one interaction with a visualization 135 that is objective and final - the visualization is part of a larger existing dialogue. 136

Data journalists' recognition of their roles as data and visualization educators also needs to be investigated. Should 138 139 they choose to take on an educator mindset, it remains an open question of how to train data journalists with this 140 mindset and equip them with teaching objectives when they are juggling other roles and responsibilities in a fast-paced 141 newsroom. Researchers, educators, and journalists could partner to explore formats for articles on topics of interest to 142 readers that explicitly target the development of certain data and visualization literacy skills. It would be worthwhile to 143 work with some readers directly to figure out what they want to learn and how they successfully learn, perhaps in a 144 145 series of workshops that could also function as trust building opportunities between journalists and readers.¹ 146

147 Another path forward is one in which educators adapt data and visual journalism as materials in their classroom 148 curricula. Challenges in teaching data visualization, described by Bach et al. [2], include "communicating the need 149 for visualization education" and "retaining motivation during learning visualization". Perhaps focusing visualization 150 151 curriculum around current events in the news could communicate the need and provide motivation to students who 152 may be impacted by these issues and seek to dissect them further through visualization. Educators can tie in widely 153

¹⁵⁴ ¹There has been a documented decrease in public trust in the news in the United States since the 1950's, which could impact impressions of data and data 155 visualizations communicated by news outlets [13, 17].

discussed data sets in the news into their lesson plans after teaching students to work with smaller, simpler data sets,
 even explicitly acknowledging and explaining current points of confusion in these data sets among the broader public
 that data journalists detect. Data journalists could monitor public interest and responses to their coverage and forward

observations to educators to build classroom lesson plans around.

¹⁶³ 4 CONCLUSION

164

175

176

184

185

186

187

188

189

190

191

192

193

Data and visual journalism is an opportunity for the public to understand the relevance of data and data visualizations, 165 as well as sharpen their data and visualization literacy skills. The inherently polarizing nature of many topics covered 166 167 by data journalism underscores the importance of considering diverse perspectives and ideologies when teaching 168 these skills. Data journalists could collaborate with researchers and educators in data and visualization literacy to 169 understand their audiences, create pieces that intentionally foster certain competencies, and provide materials and 170 audience observations to educators for classroom use. As Bach et al. [2] point out in their call to action, there is a need 171 172 for more interdisciplinary communities to discuss approaches to teaching visualization literacy - this is a community 173 that data journalists can be a part of. 174

REFERENCES

- [1] Stephanie Adeline, Connie Hanzhang Jin, Alyson Hurt, Thomas Wilburn, Daniel Wood, and Ruth Talbot. 2020. Tracking the coronavirus around
 the U.S.: See how your state is doing. Retrieved February 28, 2024 from https://www.npr.org/sections/health-shots/2020/09/01/816707182/map tracking-the-spread-of-the-coronavirus-in-the-u-s
- [2] Benjamin Bach, Mandy Keck, Fateme Rajabiyazdi, Tatiana Losev, Isabel Meirelles, Jason Dykes, Robert S. Laramee, Mashael AlKadi, Christina Stoiber, Samuel Huron, Charles Perin, Luiz Morais, Wolfgang Aigner, Doris Kosminsky, Magdalena Boucher, Søren Knudsen, Areti Manataki, Jan Aerts, Uta Hinrichs, Jonathan C. Roberts, and Sheelagh Carpendale. 2023. Challenges and Opportunities in Data Visualization Education: A Call to Action. http://arxiv.org/abs/2308.07703 arXiv:2308.07703 [cs].
 [6] P. L. B. Barter, M. S. Start, C. S. Start, S. Start, S. Start, C. S. Start, S.
 - [3] Rahul Bhargava. 2015. Beyond Data Literacy: Reinventing Community Engagement and Empowerment in the Age of Data. Technical Report. https://datapopalliance.org/wp-content/uploads/2015/11/Beyond-Data-Literacy-2015.pdf
 - [4] Jeremy Boy, Ronald A. Rensink, Enrico Bertini, and Jean-Daniel Fekete. 2014. A Principled Way of Assessing Visualization Literacy. IEEE Transactions on Visualization and Computer Graphics 20, 12 (Dec. 2014), 1963–1972. https://doi.org/10.1109/TVCG.2014.2346984
 - [5] Katy Börner, Andreas Bueckle, and Michael Ginda. 2019. Data visualization literacy: Definitions, conceptual frameworks, exercises, and assessments. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences 116, 6 (Feb. 2019), 1857–1864. https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1807180116
 - [6] Javier Calzada Prado and Miguel Ángel Marzal. 2013. Incorporating Data Literacy into Information Literacy Programs: Core Competencies and Contents. Libri 63, 2 (Jan. 2013), 123–134. https://doi.org/10.1515/libri-2013-0010
 - [7] Kenneth Chang. 2020. A Different Way to Chart the Spread of Coronavirus. Retrieved February 28, 2024 from https://www.nytimes.com/2020/03/ 20/health/coronavirus-data-logarithm-chart.html
 - [8] Michael Corey and C. J. Sinner. 2020. 360 deaths or 22,000? Why Minnesota's COVID-19 models are so different. Retrieved February 28, 2024 from https://www.startribune.com/360-deaths-or-22-000-why-minnesota-s-covid-19-models-are-so-different/568966211/
- [9] Jonathan D Ericson, William S Albert, and Ja-Nae Duane. 2022. Political affiliation moderates subjective interpretations of COVID-19 graphs. Big
 Data & Society 9, 1 (Jan. 2022), 205395172210806. https://doi.org/10.1177/20539517221080678
- [10] Katherine Fink and C. W. Anderson. 2015. Data Journalism in the United States. Journalism Studies 16, 4 (July 2015), 467–481. https://doi.org/10.
 1080/1461670X.2014.939852 Publisher: Routledge _eprint: https://doi.org/10.1080/1461670X.2014.939852.
- [11] Minami Funakoshi, Elizabeth Culliford, and Wen Foo. 2020. How political campaigns use your data. Retrieved March 7, 2024 from https:
 //www.reuters.com/graphics/USA-ELECTION/DATA-VISUAL/yxmvjjgojvr/
- [12] Lily W. Ge, Yuan Cui, and Matthew Kay. 2023. CALVI: Critical Thinking Assessment for Literacy in Visualizations. In *Proceedings of the 2023 CHI* Conference on Human Factors in Computing Systems. ACM, Hamburg Germany, 1–18. https://doi.org/10.1145/3544548.3581406
- [13] Paul Gronke and Timothy E. Cook. 2007. Disdaining the Media: The American Public's Changing Attitudes Toward the News. *Political Communication* 24, 3 (Aug. 2007), 259–281. https://doi.org/10.1080/10584600701471591
 [20] Laboratory and the Newson Public of Communication and the Newson Public of Comm
- [14] Edith S. Gummer and Ellen B. Mandinach. 2015. Building a Conceptual Framework for Data Literacy. *Teachers College Record* 117, 040305 (April 2015), 1–22.
- [15] Helen Ai He, Jagoda Walny, Sonja Thoma, Sheelagh Carpendale, and Wesley Willett. 2023. Enthusiastic and Grounded, Avoidant and Cautious:
 Understanding Public Receptivity to Data and Visualizations. *IEEE Transactions on Visualization and Computer Graphics* 30, 1 (2023), 1435–1445.
 https://doi.org/10.1109/TVCG.2023.3326917

4

The Role of Data Journalists as Educators

216

230

231

232

233

234

259 260

- [16] Dan M. Kahan, Ellen Peters, Erica Cantrell Dawson, and Paul Slovic. 2017. Motivated numeracy and enlightened self-government. *Behavioural Public Policy* 1, 1 (May 2017), 54–86. https://doi.org/10.1017/bpp.2016.2
- [17] Jonathan McDonald Ladd. 2010. The Role of Media Distrust in Partisan Voting. *Political Behavior* 32, 4 (Dec. 2010), 567–585. https://doi.org/10.
 212 1007/s11109-010-9123-z
- [18] Crystal Lee, Tanya Yang, Gabrielle D Inchoco, Graham M. Jones, and Arvind Satyanarayan. 2021. Viral Visualizations: How Coronavirus Skeptics
 Use Orthodox Data Practices to Promote Unorthodox Science Online. In *Proceedings of the 2021 CHI Conference on Human Factors in Computing* Systems. ACM, Yokohama Japan, 1–18. https://doi.org/10.1145/3411764.3445211
 - [19] Sukwon Lee, Sung-Hee Kim, and Bum Chul Kwon. 2017. VLAT: Development of a Visualization Literacy Assessment Test. IEEE Transactions on Visualization and Computer Graphics 23, 1 (Jan. 2017), 551–560. https://doi.org/10.1109/TVCG.2016.2598920
- [20] Jordana M. Liberali, Valerie F. Reyna, Sarah Furlan, Lilian M. Stein, and Seth T. Pardo. 2012. Individual Differences in Numeracy and Cognitive
 Reflection, with Implications for Biases and Fallacies in Probability Judgment. *Journal of Behavioral Decision Making* 25, 4 (Oct. 2012), 361–381.
 https://doi.org/10.1002/bdm.752
- [21] Betsy Mason. 2020. Opinion | This Election Map Will Be Everywhere. Don't Let It Fool You. Retrieved March 7, 2024 from https://www.nytimes.
 com/interactive/2020/10/30/opinion/election-results-maps.html
- 222
 [22] The Learning Network. 2020. What's Going On in This Graph? | 2020 Presidential Election Maps. Retrieved March 7, 2024 from https:

 223
 //www.nytimes.com/2020/11/19/learning/whats-going-on-in-this-graph-2020-presidential-election-maps.html
- [23] Evan M. Peck, Sofia E. Ayuso, and Omar El-Etr. 2019. Data is Personal: Attitudes and Perceptions of Data Visualization in Rural Pennsylvania. In Proceedings of the 2019 CHI Conference on Human Factors in Computing Systems. ACM, Glasgow Scotland Uk, 1–12. https://doi.org/10.1145/3290605.
 3300474
- [24] Ellen Peters, Daniel Västfjäll, Paul Slovic, C K Mertz, Ketti Mazzocco, and Stephan Dickert. 2006. Numeracy and Decision Making. Psychological Science 17, 5 (2006), 407–413.
- [25] Siobhan Roberts. 2020. Flattening the Coronavirus Curve. Retrieved February 28, 2024 from https://www.nytimes.com/article/flatten-curve coronavirus.html
 - [26] The New York Times. 2020. Coronavirus in the U.S.: Latest Map and Case Count. Retrieved February 28, 2024 from https://www.nytimes.com/ interactive/2023/us/covid-cases.html
 - [27] The Texas Tribune. 2020. How coronavirus impacted Texas: Hospitalizations, vaccinations, cases and deaths. Retrieved February 28, 2024 from https://apps.texastribune.org/features/2020/texas-coronavirus-cases-map/
 - [28] Phil Vahey, Louise Yarnall, Charles Patton, Daniel Zalles, and Karen Swan. 2006. Mathematizing Middle School: Results From a Cross-Disciplinary Study of Data Literacy. In American Educational Research Association Annual Conference. 1–15.
- [23] Annika Wolff, Daniel Gooch, Jose J. Cavaro Montaner, Umar Rashid, and Gerd Kortuem. 2016. Creating an understanding of data literacy for a data-driven society. *The Journal of Community Informatics* 12, 3 (2016), 9–26.